





		Argumentation and Evaluation Ro	utine
Figure 1: Argumentation & Evaluation Guide			
Topic:	Na	ame:	
Title:			
Source:	_ Da	ate:	
What is the Claim, including any Qualifiers? Are there qualifiers? Yes/N	No. (If	yes, underline them.)	
Drinking more than 3 colas a day may weaken bones in women	n.		
2) What Evidence is presented?		(5) What chain of reasoning (warrant) connects the evidence to the	$\overline{}$
In column 3, identify the type of evidence with the letter: Data (D), Fact (F)	(3)	claim? In column 6, identify type of reasoning with the letter(s):	6
Opinion (O), Theory (T).		for AUTHORITY (A), THEORY (T), or type of LOGIC: Analogy	
For women or girls who drank 3 or more colas a day:		(AN), Correlation (C), Cause-Effect (CE), Generalization (G)	
Harvard study with 2,400 high school girls found less bone in those who	D	Studies conducted by reputable institutions found that drinking 3 or	A
drank over 3 sodas a day.		more sodas a day caused women to have less bone density than	CE
Another study of 2,500 women found the same.		those who didn't.	_
Tufts Univ. study found 5% less density for women. Phosphoric acid in colas interferes with ability to use calcium to build	D	This cause-and-effect relationship is supported by the theory that	T
bones.	T	phosphoric acid weakens bones.	-
TERRITORIAN TO THE COMPANIES OF THE CONTROL OF THE			
Evaluate the quality of the evidence as poor, average or good. Explain your evaluation.		Texaluate the quality of the chain of reasoning as poor, average or good. Explain your evaluation.	
Reliable Good – there were different studies.		Strength of Authority Good - reputable Institutions	
Valid Good – they studied women and drew conclu	sions	Application of Theory Good - accepted theory	
Objective (no bias) Good - reputable institutions		Type of Logic Good - cause and effect logic	
Methodology Good - many subjects			
8 What are your concerns about the believability of the claim? (your counte	rargur	ments, rebuttals or new questions)?	
The claim seems believable, but I would like more studies w	ith m	ien.	
0			-
Accept, reject, or withhold judgment about the claim. Explain your decision.			
I accept the claim because good studies by reputable institut	ions	found a cause-and-effect relationship between drinking soda	1
and bone loss in women.	No.		
		© Bulgren & Ellis 2010	
Figure 1: Sample Argumentation and Evaluation Guide			